A Keeper’s Role in Animal Welfare

Amanda Ista
amanda.ista@milwcnty.com
Zoo Keeper – Big Cats
Milwaukee County Zoo

National AAZK Conference 2013
Greensboro, NC
Animal Welfare is a Hot Topic

- Zoos are creating centers for animal welfare
- Research projects
- Accreditation Standards
Workshop Goals

- Define animal welfare
- Discuss current trends and topics from the AZA Animal Welfare Committee
- Discuss how to assess animal welfare innovatively and objectively.
- Discuss how to approach animal welfare issues in a professional and productive manner.
History of Animal Welfare

“Five Freedoms of Animal Welfare”

- developed in 1979
- Farm Animal Welfare Council:

1. Freedom from thirst or hunger
2. Freedom from discomfort
3. Freedom from pain, injury and disease
4. Freedom to express normal behavior
5. Freedom from fear and distress
Animal Welfare Defined

- **Scientific Approach**

- assure the physical health and psychological well-being of animals in our care
PHILOSOPHICAL APPROACH

- Argues against the use of animals for any reason based on the ethical argument that animals deserve the same rights as humans.
The critical difference between animal welfare and animal rights is that while animal welfare aims to provide zoo animals with the best possible lives, animal rights supporters generally believe that animals should not be in captivity in the first place.
Elements of Animal Welfare

- Husbandry
- Nutrition
- Habitat
- Health
- Enrichment
- Training
- Research
Husbandry

- Addresses animals’ motivational needs
- Provides animals with choice and control
- Matches the environment to animals’ natural adaptations
- Encourages animals to develop and use their own cognitive abilities
Nutrition

- Ensures that an animal is provided with a complete and balanced diet.
- Stimulates natural feeding behaviors.
- Nutritionally balanced diet that the animal eats consistently.
An animal's physical and social environment
Allows the animals to perform species appropriate behaviors
Quality of space
Cleanliness
Appropriate environmental conditions (temperature, shade, etc.)
Ground cover, water, plants, visual barriers, etc.
The prevention and treatment of illness and injury

Preventative medicine (Ex. vaccines, exams, dental health, fecals)

Diagnostic tests and treatment plans

Euthanasia/Necropsy

Quarantine
Using an animal’s natural and individual history to provide species-appropriate behavioral opportunities & choices

An well developed enrichment program includes:

- setting appropriate behavioral goals
- planning & approval processes to ensure safety
- methods of implementation (schedules)
- methods of documentation, evaluation, and refinement
Uses a variety of techniques including positive reinforcement based conditioning to teach an animal to cooperate with and participate in its own husbandry.

- Reduces stress of husbandry and veterinary procedures
- Facilitates daily management
- Facilitates positive social dynamics
- Enhances psychological well-being
Uses the scientific method to address questions about an animal’s behavior, physiology, genetics, welfare potential, etc.

Science Review Committee
SSP research requests
Behavioral Data Analysis
Welfare Assessment
Potential Welfare Issues

- Animal welfare issues may include (but are not limited to):
  - Health concerns
  - Social housing concerns
  - Housing or facility issues
  - Behavior abnormalities
  - Nutrition or diet concerns
Diverse committee established in 2000 to foster an understanding of what welfare is, to continually improve the welfare of animals in our care by ensuring it stays a top priority in AZA institutions and to be proactive advocates of welfare issues beyond our zoo gates.

AAZK Liaison
Animal Welfare refers to an animal’s collective physical, mental, and emotional states over a period of time, and is measured on a continuum from good to poor.

Explanation: An animal typically experiences good welfare when healthy, comfortable, well-nourished, safe, able to develop and express species-typical relationships, behaviors, and cognitive abilities, and not suffering from unpleasant states such as pain, fear, or distress. Because physical, mental, and emotional states may be dependent on one another and can vary from day to day, it is important to consider these states in combination with one another over time to provide an assessment of an animal’s overall welfare status.
Providing for good animal welfare encompasses both ethical and scientific responsibilities. AZA-accredited institutions have an ethical responsibility to ensure the well-being of the animals in their care. In addition, AZA-accredited institutions have a scientific responsibility to gain a greater understanding of the well-being of the animals in their care by advancing animal welfare science.
The AZA Animal Welfare committee promotes good welfare for animals in AZA-accredited zoos and aquariums, by assisting member institutions in identifying and applying best practices in animal welfare and through promoting advances in animal welfare science.
The Animal Welfare Committee will achieve its mission by:

- Promoting a common understanding of animal welfare in the zoo and aquarium community
- Assisting zoos and aquariums in identifying and applying best practices in animal welfare
- Encouraging the development of research projects and assessment tools to advance and monitor animal welfare
- Educating and engaging AZA zoos and aquariums in applying assessment tools
- Understanding and influencing public perception about animal welfare in AZA zoos and aquariums
CURRENT PROJECTS

- Program animal policies and study
- Exotic animals as pets
- Institutional welfare processes
- Research-promoting the "science" of welfare
- Accreditation standards
- Animal Care Manuals
- Elephant Study
- Entertainment guidelines
The institution must develop a clear process for identifying, communicating, and addressing animal welfare concerns within the institution in a timely manner and without retribution.

Explanation: It is recommended that a committee or some other process be identified to address staff concerns for animal welfare within the institution. The committee or process should include staff with the experience and authority necessary to evaluate and implement any necessary changes.
Institutional Animal Welfare Process

- To provide animal care staff members with a protocol for bringing up welfare questions and concerns.
- To highlight the role that animal welfare plays in all aspects for your animal management.
- To coordinate a response, educate staff members and identify welfare successes throughout the institution.
Assessing Animal Welfare
Welfare Trak and Brookfield Zoo

- Center for Animal Welfare
- http://www.welfaretrak.org
What Can You Do?

- Brainstorming and activity
The Tough Questions

- Live Prey
- Pest Species
- Animal Acquisition and Disposition
- Euthanasia
- Hand-rearing
- Program Animals
New Ideas in Animal Welfare

- Exhibit Design
- Keeper-Animal Relationship
- Human-Animal Interaction
Resource List

- Center for Zoo Animal Welfare
  - Detroit Zoological Society
  - czaf.org
- AZA Animal Welfare Committee
Additional Animal Welfare Resources and Links

http://czaw.org/resources (Center for Zoo Animal Welfare – Detroit Zoological Society)

http://masonabwlab.wordpress.com/ (Georgia Mason Lab Blog)

http://www.aps.uoguelph.ca/~gman/StereotypicAnimalBehaviour/library.shtml (Georgia Mason’s website on stereotypic behaviors)

http://www.czs.org/czs/czaw (Chicago Zoological Society - Brookfield Zoo)


http://www.uoguelph.ca/csaw/awjac2012/ (welfare judging contests)
What is an IAWP and Why do we need it?

AZA Animal Welfare Committee
Sept. 2009
AZA Accreditation Standards

“The institution must develop a clear process for identifying and addressing animal welfare concerns within the institution.”

- This means: It is recommended that a committee or some other process be identified to address staff concerns for animal welfare within the institution. The committee or process should include staff with the experience and authority necessary to evaluate and implement any necessary changes.
Why have an IAWP?

- To provide animal care staff members with a protocol for bringing up welfare questions and concerns.

- To coordinate a response, educate staff members, and identify welfare successes throughout your institution.

- To highlight the role that animal welfare plays in all aspects of your animal management.

- To describe your philosophy about animal welfare, and to promote awareness of welfare to your staff.

- To recognize the significant advances made by your institution in the effective care of your animals.
More Reasons?

- Helps to formalize any pre-existing processes at your institution that already focus on animal welfare.

- Increased communication about welfare.

- Because the PETA ‘whistleblower’ website is not a good alternative to an IAWP.
  - The idea is the same, but PETA cannot address real or perceived welfare issues. Your institutions can.
Zoo Insiders: Report Concerns About Your Zoo Here

Required Information

Zoo name

Zoo city

Zoo state

Date of incident (mm/dd/yyyy)

Time frame of incident (if the incident occurred over a period of time)

Type of incident (check as many as apply)

- Escape
- Death
- Injury to animal(s)
- Injury to zoo personnel
- Neglect
- Abuse
- Improper diet
Questions an IAWP should address

- How can a staff member identify a potential animal welfare issue, and to whom can it be reported?
- How will the welfare concerns of staff members be documented by area managers/leaders?
- How will the appropriate group/committee review reported/identified animal welfare issues and take actions?
- How will the manager/leader and/or committee provide feedback to staff who raised the issue?
Questions an IAWP should address

- How will area managers and/or committee ensure that animal welfare topics are addressed openly/directly?

- How will records of welfare issues, discussions, related research, actions taken, and outcomes be recorded and shared within the institution?

- Proactive roles: How to better educate staff and proactively address potential welfare concerns up front?
How to set up an IAWP

- Look at pre-existing committees and protocols at your institution (e.g., IACUC, research review committee).

- Look at examples of IAWPs from other institutions
  - e.g., Toronto Zoo, Disney’s Animal Kingdom, Brookfield Zoo, Atlanta Zoo. (we will put these on the website soon).

- Get staff input (“buy in”) and feedback at all levels
  - Directors, curators, managers, keepers, veterinarians, nutritionists, legal, PR, education, etc.

- Developing an IAWC is one approach
  - IAWC = Institutional Animal Welfare Committee
Possible Roles of an IAWC

*Coordinate the IAWP by:*

- Receiving, documenting, discussing, and potentially addressing animal welfare questions/concerns submitted by staff members.
- Promoting awareness and guidance on ethical, legal, scientific, and practical issues concerning the care and welfare of the animals throughout the institution.
- Acting as a general forum for welfare, animal care, and research discussions.
- Coordinating facility inspections and other welfare monitoring efforts.
Who should be on an IAWC?

Ideally a cross section of staff representing various departments and roles.

E.g., curators, vets, scientists, educators, public relations, marketing, maintenance, food services, external peers.
**IACUC vs. IAWC?**

- **Traditional IACUC:**
  - Animal research focus
  - Implies USDA involvement

- **Your Animal Welfare Committee:**
  - Exhibit animal focus
  - Involves all collection animals
An Example: Disney’s Animal Programs

Disney’s Animal Care and Welfare Committee

Statement of purpose
To support Disney’s Animal Programs’ mission of delivering uncompromising excellence in animal care and welfare by:
- Promoting the optimal care and welfare of our animals;
- Routinely inspecting animals and their environments to ensure daily excellence in care and welfare;
- Being a forum for welfare, animal care, and research discussions;
- Receiving and addressing animal welfare concerns from Cast Members;
- Serving in an advisory capacity to promote awareness of animal welfare issues;
- Offering advice and guidance on ethical, legal, scientific, and practical issues concerning the care and welfare of our animals;
- Reviewing the scientific integrity and welfare implications of research proposals and requests for biological samples.

Our guiding principles include:
- Every Animal Programs Cast Member is responsible for enhancing animal welfare and providing optimal care for the animals in our collection.
- Animal welfare is achieved proactively through Cast education (awareness building) and through our assessment of and feedback about animal care.
What We Do

- ***Animal welfare oversight***
- ***Inspection of all animal areas every 6 months***
- ***Review research requests***

Inspection Checklist
- Schedule inspection date & time with area managers
- Schedule time with frontline Cast during walk-through
- Review previous facility inspection report
- Be familiar with any significant animal issues in area
CZS Animal Welfare Committee

- The living animals we care for are the heart and soul of Brookfield Zoo—we have adopted AZA standards to ensure the safety and well-being of each and every animal in our care.
- Establishment of the CZS Animal Welfare Committee.
- The Committee was developed with a single goal in mind—ensuring that zoo animals receive the highest quality care possible.
Purpose of CZS Animal Welfare Committee

To support our mission of delivering uncompromising excellence in animal care and welfare by:

- Promoting the optimal care and welfare of our animals.
- Being a forum for animal welfare and care.
- Receiving, addressing, and acting upon animal welfare concerns from staff.
- Serving in an advisory capacity to promote awareness of animal welfare issues.
- Offering advice and guidance on ethical, legal, scientific, and practical issues concerning the care and welfare of our animals.
Animal Welfare Awareness Course

Chicago Zoological Society

© 2008, Chicago Zoological Society/Brookfield Zoo, All Rights Reserved
Course Objectives

In this course we’ll:

- Define Animal Welfare (via the AZA definition).
- Explain the purpose of the CZS Animal Welfare Committee and Reporting Process.
- Recognize how to report a concern.
- Correctly address potential animal welfare reporting scenarios.
- Maintain and promote excellence in animal care.
Animal Welfare Concern Form
(insert hot spot interaction)

Chicago Zoological Society
Animal Welfare Concern Form

Date of Concern:

Name of Submitter:

Animal of Concern:

Common Name:

Names:

ISIS/ID #:

Species:

Specific Location:

- Housing:
  - Structural
  - Mechanical

- Health

- Social

- Basic Care

- Staffing

- Nutrition

- Behavioral

If there is an immediate need, please call x8XXX.

Concern:

Effect: What is the problem, the symptoms?


Challenges

- Anonymous or not?
- Is this a welfare or a staff issue?
- Some (many) issues are complex and can only be addressed in long-range plans.
- Long-term, mutually agreed upon outcome may not be always be feasible.
- Communication.
Some Guiding Principles

- Staff empowerment: Everyone at your institution should feel responsible for providing good welfare for animals in your collection.
- Staff (and guest) education and awareness.
- Communication.
- Excellent welfare can in part be achieved only through continuous assessment of, and feedback about animal care.
Animal Welfare refers to an animal’s collective physical, mental, and emotional states over a period of time, and is measured on a continuum from good to poor.

Explanation: An animal typically experiences good welfare when healthy, comfortable, well-nourished, safe, able to develop and express species-typical relationships, behaviors, and cognitive abilities, and not suffering from unpleasant states such as pain, fear, or distress. Because physical, mental, and emotional states may be dependent on one another and can vary from day to day, it is important to consider these states in combination with one another over time to provide an assessment of an animal’s overall welfare status.

AZA Animal Welfare Committee Position Statement:
Providing for good animal welfare encompasses both ethical and scientific responsibilities. AZA-accredited institutions have an ethical responsibility to ensure the well-being of the animals in their care. In addition, AZA-accredited institutions have a scientific responsibility to gain a greater understanding of the well-being of the animals in their care by advancing animal welfare science.

AZA Animal Welfare Committee Mission Statement:
The AZA Animal Welfare committee promotes good welfare for animals in AZA-accredited zoos and aquariums, by assisting member institutions in identifying and applying best practices in animal welfare and through promoting advances in animal welfare science.

The Animal Welfare Committee will achieve its mission by:
- Promoting a common understanding of animal welfare in the zoo and aquarium community
- Assisting zoos and aquariums in identifying and applying best practices in animal welfare
- Encouraging the development of research projects and assessment tools to advance and monitor animal welfare
- Educating and engaging AZA zoos and aquariums in applying assessment tools
- Understanding and influencing public perception about animal welfare in AZA zoos and aquariums
AZA Accreditation Standard 1.5.8 stipulates that: "The institution must develop a clear process for identifying communicating, and addressing animal welfare concerns within the institution in a timely manner." It is recommended that each AZA-accredited institution establish a specific Institutional Animal Welfare Process (IAWP) to address staff concerns for animal welfare and an Institutional Animal Welfare Committee (IAWC) to manage their IAWP. This Standard is intended to advance the important role that animal welfare plays in all aspects of animal management within AZA-accredited zoos and aquariums as well as recognize the significant advances made by these institutions in the effective care of their animals. The AZA Animal Welfare Committee (AWC) and Accreditation Commission have developed these guidelines to assist institutions develop their IAWP and IAWC.

The IAWP is important for raising the profile of animal welfare as a part of the institution’s culture, recognizing the positive impact animal care decisions have, and providing a means for animal care staff to follow a well-defined process when raising animal welfare questions/concerns to their supervisors and/or their IAWC. This IAWP should facilitate the: identification of welfare issues noticed by staff members, coordination of appropriate responses, education of staff members about welfare issues, and dissemination of animal welfare successes throughout the institution. Each institution should create an IAWP that meets their specific individual needs, while encompassing key components recommended in these guidelines.

The IAWC should include staff with the experience and authority necessary to evaluate and implement any necessary changes. It is important to note that some welfare issues are complex, and a long-term, mutually agreed upon outcome may not always be feasible. There may be a need for considerable education and explanation to convey the complexity of various issues to all involved, and the reason for a certain action or inaction. The role of the IAWC (or a similar group that may already exist within the institution) in educating staff members about animal welfare is vital to this process.

Ultimately, the goal of setting up an IAWP and/or IAWC is to promote excellence in animal care and to provide an open, educational process to discuss and learn about animal welfare topics.

**Overall Purpose of the Institutional Animal Welfare Process**

**The general goals of the IAWP should be to:**

- Provide a process for staff members at the zoo or aquarium to be able to express any welfare questions/concerns they have about animals in the collection to their leaders and managers;
- Provide a clearly defined channel of communication through which welfare questions are reported, documented, researched, addressed, and then reported back to staff members;
- Ensure that welfare questions/concerns are reviewed by more than one entity (i.e., not just a direct manager) to increase awareness of issues, and to provide greater expertise and feedback to animal care staff;
- Support animal managers in discussing animal welfare issues with animal care staff, and clearly articulating steps taken by the institution to research or address the issue;
- Record and highlight improvements made to the management of animals that have led to significant welfare improvements.
The IAWP should provide a step-by-step process that specifically addresses each of the following questions:

- How can a staff member raise a potential animal welfare issue, and to whom (e.g., the IAWC, direct supervisor, etc.) can they report it? Can this process be anonymous?
  - Animal welfare issues may include, but are not limited to: health concerns, social group concerns, housing or facility issues, behavior abnormalities, nutrition or diet concerns, or any questions related to the welfare of the animals.
- In what way will the welfare concerns of staff members be documented by area managers/supervisors?
  - A record should be kept of welfare issues, and should identify when the issue was raised, and what response the manager/supervisor or IAWC gave (including "no action taken").
- How will welfare issues and actions taken be communicated to the appropriate group/IAWC, and how frequently will this occur?
- How will the appropriate group/IAWC review identified animal welfare issues and actions taken?
- For unresolved issues or for issues where current actions may not be sufficient, how will the animal welfare issue be further investigated and documented, and by whom?
- How will the manager/supervisor and/or IAWC provide feedback to the staff member who raised the issue?
  - There may be a need for considerable education and explanation to convey the complexity of some animal welfare issues, and for the reason for a certain action or inaction.
  - It may be difficult to provide specific reports if a welfare concern was submitted anonymously.
- If the staff member is unsatisfied with the response from their direct manager/supervisor, and/or IAWC what is that staff member’s recourse (e.g., contacting the supervisor’s supervisor; contacting the IAWC directly)?
- How will the area managers/supervisor and/or IAWC ensure that animal welfare topics are addressed openly and directly?
  - It is recommended that the IAWC and area managers meet with animal care teams on a regular basis, in order to discuss animal welfare issues, highlight animal welfare successes, and provide an opportunity for staff members to voice questions/concerns.
- How will the area managers and/or IAWC ensure confidentiality of staff members who report any animal welfare concerns through approved channels of the IAWP, and ensure that no retribution occurs after a well-thought out concern is brought forward?
- How will records of welfare issues, discussions, related research, actions taken, and outcomes and successes be recorded and shared within the institution?
  - It is recommended, if possible, that IAWC reports and meeting minutes are made freely available to all staff members (maintaining confidentiality of animal care staff where appropriate).

Overall Purpose of the Institutional Animal Welfare Committee

Many institutions have groups or committees tasked with discussing or addressing issues related to animal welfare (e.g., Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee [IACUC]). Another role for these pre-existing committees, or for the development of a specific IAWC, would be to manage the IAWP by:

- Receiving, documenting, discussing, and potentially addressing animal welfare questions/concerns submitted by staff members.
- Serving in an advisory capacity to promote awareness and guidance on ethical, legal, scientific, and practical issues concerning the care and welfare of the animals throughout the institution, and acting as a general forum for welfare, animal care, and research discussions (e.g., what is animal welfare and how can it be assessed?).
Members appointed to the IAWC who are responsible in the development and oversight of the IAWP should include individuals such as:

- Key stakeholders (i.e., directors, curators, managers, keepers, veterinarians, nutritionists, as well as legal, public relations, and education departments) should be included in the development of an institution’s policy, to ensure that channels of communication are clear and open.
- Staff from all levels of the organization should be involved in the development of the process, but those staff members tasked with directly addressing welfare questions/concerns (e.g., an IAWC) should include people with sufficient expertise and authority within the institution to implement forward actions.

Beyond its direct role in managing the IAWP, the IAWC may also play other roles within the institutions, such as:

- Coordinating and collaborating with other possible committees (e.g., IACUC-type committees, if they already exist at the institution) that perform routine inspections on the animals in their care and their environments to ensure excellence in animal care and management.
- Reviewing scientific integrity and welfare implications of research proposals and requests for biological samples (typically performed by an IACUC-type committee).
- Addressing welfare issues associated with pest control, feeder animals, feral animals, and domestic/exotic animals that may be dropped off at the zoo or aquarium.
- Discussing the need for, or timing of euthanasia in animals by developing and using a series of euthanasia guidelines.

Additional Support

Because all zoos and aquariums are different, no one particular IAWP or IAWC structure will work for every institution. To further assist institutions meet AZA Accreditation Standard 1.5.8., examples of different IAWPs and IAWCs implemented by AZA-accredited institutions of various types and sizes can be found on the AZA website. In addition, the AZA AWC is available to answer any questions about the Standard and its recommendations, these guidelines, and remains committed to promoting an increased awareness of the benefits of establishing both an Institutional Animal Welfare Process and Institutional Animal Welfare Committee.
WelfareTrak® Helps You Monitor the Welfare of Individual Animals

WelfareTrak® is a user-friendly monitoring tool that allows caretakers to complete weekly online surveys for individual animals and generates reports that highlight potential shifts in welfare status.

Survey Step 2: Complete Rating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Physical Condition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>Appetite</td>
<td>Bobby Bow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Drinking</td>
<td>Fay Flowers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interactions with</td>
<td>Suzy Sullivan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Locomotion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physical Condition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Posture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Physical Condition: Poor = 1, Excellent = 5

Testimonials

“It made me more observant of their ‘whole selves’... it made me look at every aspect of the animal.”
~Keeper, 12 years of experience

“This helps you get to know the keepers who you thought you’ve known for years — and may help to give you a different perspective... this helps you understand where they’re coming from.”
~Keeper, 17 years of experience

“The best part about WelfareTrak® is putting some sort of quantitative analysis on what a lot of keepers would refer to as gut feelings.”
~Lead Keeper, 20 years of experience

“WelfareTrak® helped staff make better observations.”
~Lead Keeper, 28 years of experience

Support Provided by

Kenneth A. Scott Charitable Trust, a KeyBank Trust
Chicago Zoological Society Chicago Board of Trade Endangered Species Fund
Women’s Board of the Chicago Zoological Society

www.welfaretrak.org